Coordination & Monitoring Unit
Punjab Clean Air Program (PCAP)
Planning & Development Board,

Government of the Puniab

SHORTLISTING REPORT

REQUEST FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (REOI)

`Hiring of Consultancy Services for Independent Procurement Audit under PCAP

Ref# PK-PCAP CMU-525759-CS-CQS
April 07, 2026

Program Director, CMU-Punjab Clean Air Program, Planning & Development Board,
06-A, Ahmad Block, New Garden Town
Lahore

I. BACKGROUND

The Punjab Clean Air Program (PCAP) is a World Bank-funded hybrid of Program for Results (PforR) to link funding with measurable improvements and Investment Project Financing (IPF) operation to support technical assessments, policy development, and institutional capacity-building, with a total cost of USD 300 million over 5 years (2025-2030). The program integrates strategies such as expanding public transport with electric buses, enforcing stricter vehicle inspections, retiring high-emission vehicles, and promoting electric two- and three-wheelers. These interventions are designed to reduce traffic congestion, improve fuel efficiency, and lower carbon emissions, ultimately fostering a more sustainable urban transport system. The Program Development Objective is to strengthen air quality management and reduce population-weighted PM 2.5 annual average exposure in Lahore Division.

II. SHORTLISTING PROCESS

i. REQUEST FOR EXPRESSION OF INTERESTS (REOIs)

The Request for Expression of Interest (REOI) was published in national newspapers on April 11, 2026, and also uploaded on the websites of CMU-PCAP and STEP.

The following 06 firms participated in the procurement process till closing date and time:

Sr. No.	Name of Firms/JVs
01	M/s. KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co. Chartered Accountants
02	M/s. Riaz Ahmad, Saqib, Gohar & Co.
03	M/s. Muniff Zia Ud Din & Co. Chartered Accountants
04	M/s. Malik Haroon Ahmad & Co. Chartered Accountants
05	M/s. UHY Hassan Naeem & Co. Chartered Accountants
06	M/s. Crowe Hussain Chaudhury & Co.

ii. SUBMISSION OF EOI

The date and time for submission of EOI was fixed on 24.04.2026 at 05:00 P.M. The EOIs from above mentioned Six (06) firms were received on or before the fixed date and time. EOI received after closing date and time and submission of EOI through email did not considered for evaluation.

iii. SHORTLISTING CRITERIA

The Consultant Selection Committee (CSC) evaluated the Expression of Interests (EOIs) on the basis of following parameters as mentioned in the Request for Expression of Interest (REOIs):

- The Internal Auditor shall be a firm of Chartered Accountants having at least 10 years' relevant experience in auditing, monitoring, assessing and verification of financials in public sector/donor funded programs as relevant to the TORs shall be required **(Letter of Incorporation of firms will be required)**.
- Should have completed at least five (05) similar projects in public sector/donor funded projects of comparable scale and complexity **(Copies of verifiable of similar nature of contracts with copies of notification of Award and/or Contracts and full address and contact information of the employer)**.
- Should have sufficient HR / managerial capacity and expertise in the areas covered in the TORs. **[CVs will not be evaluated at the shortlisting stage]**.

iv. SHORTLISTED FIRMS

<table>
<tr><th>Sr. No.</th><th>Name of Firm</th><th>Reasons for Shortlisting</th><th>Status of the Firm</th></tr>
<tr><td>01</td><td>KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co. Pakistan</td><td>
1. The firm M/s. KPMG Pakistan was registered in 1970 and has over 56 years of professional experience. The firm fulfills the requirement of at least 10 years' relevant experience in auditing, monitoring, assessing and verification of financials in public sector/donor funded programs as relevant to the TORs
2. M/s. KPMG Pakistan has completed multiple large-scale assignments. The detail of similar projects considered are given as under:
<table>
<tr><th>Sr#</th><th>Name of Client</th><th>Assignment Name</th><th>Duration</th><th>Cost</th></tr>
<tr><td>1</td><td>TEVTA</td><td>Financial and Performance Audit of the Punjab Technical and Vocational Training Authority (TEVTA)</td><td>2025</td><td>PKR. 13.250 Million</td></tr>
<tr><td>2</td><td>URBAN Unit</td><td>Performance Audit of Punjab Industrial State Development and Management Company (PIEDMC) and FIEDMC)</td><td>2024</td><td>PKR. 28.75 Million</td></tr>
<tr><td>3</td><td>Punjab Education Foundation (PEF)</td><td>Verification of Financial / Physical Data of PEFN</td><td>2023</td><td>PKR. 15.45 Million</td></tr>
<tr><td>4.</td><td>USAID-Economy Recovery and Development Activity (ERDA)</td><td>Internal Audit and Enterprise Risk Assessment Training</td><td>2022</td><td>PKR. 1.916 Million</td></tr>
<tr><td>5.</td><td>P&D-KPK</td><td>Internal Audit under Governance & Policy Project - P&D</td><td>2017-22</td><td>PKR. 3.00 Million</td></tr>
<tr><td>6</td><td>USAID</td><td>Financial Review of Eleven USAID G2G PMU /IUS</td><td>2016</td><td>USD. 44,990</td></tr>
<tr><td>7</td><td>PSHD</td><td>Audit of health council funds</td><td>2017</td><td>PKR.11.25</td></tr>
<tr><td>8</td><td>PMIU-KPK</td><td>Financial Management Support Services</td><td>2017</td><td>USD.85,941</td></tr>
<tr><td>9</td><td>Secondary Education Department, Government of Baluchistan</td><td>Internal Audit Services</td><td>2014-15</td><td>PKR.1.999</td></tr>
</table>
</td><td>1st ranked</td></tr>
</table>

3. KPMG Pakistan possesses strong HR and managerial capacity with a team of professionals, covering the scope of the assignment, as follows:

Sr. NO.	Name of Consultant	Position	Requirement	Qualification / Experience of the Consultant
01	Usman Tariq	Team Lead	CA/CPA/ACCA with 10 years' work experience	Chartered Accountant with 15 years of relevant experience
02	Faheem Ali Khan	Coordinator-I	16 year education with 7 year relevant experience	ACCA with 12 years of experience
03	Wahhaj Anwar	Coordinator-II	16 year education with 7 year relevant experience	ACCA with 08 years of experience
04	Nabeel Mudassar	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-I	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	CA with 5 years of experience
05	Umais Ali	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-II	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	ACCA with 05 years of experience
06	Daniyal Arshad	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-III	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	ACCA with 05 years of experience
07	Hina Khan	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-IV	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	ACCA with 05 years of experience

Strengths & Weakness:

Strengths:

- Strongest institutional credibility (Big-4 network, global audit methodologies)
- Extensive donor-funded experience (USAID, World Bank-type engagements)
- Proven track record of large-scale, high-value public sector assignments
- Highly qualified and well-structured team (CA/ACCA mix with strong mid-level support)
- Demonstrated expertise in risk assessment, governance, and complex audits
- Strong managerial and technical capacity aligned with TORs

<table>
<tr><td></td><td></td><td>Remarks:
Best overall fit for complex, high-value World Bank-funded program (PCAP) due to depth, scale, and international standards.

Conclusion:
The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as 10 years of relevant work experience, have completed at least Five (05) similar projects, and has sufficient HR / Managerial Capacity and Technical Expertise in the areas covered in the TORs, hence, shortlisted and ranked 1st</td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td>02</td><td>M/s. Crowe Hussain Chaudhury & Co.</td><td>1. The firm M/s. Crowe was registered in 1968 and has over 58 years of professional experience. The firm fulfills the requirement of at least 10 years' relevant experience in auditing, monitoring, assessing and verification of financials in public sector/donor funded programs as relevant to the TORs
2. M/s. Crowe Hussain. has completed multiple assignments. The detail of similar projects considered are given as under:

<table>
<tr><th>Sr#</th><th>Name of Client</th><th>Assignment Name</th><th>Duration</th><th>Cost</th></tr>
<tr><td>01</td><td>TEVTA</td><td>Pre-audit of all procurements</td><td>2021</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>02</td><td>PDS &CEA</td><td>Internal Audit Services</td><td>2019</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>03</td><td>BOP</td><td>External Assessment of Internal Audit</td><td>2016</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>04</td><td>SNGPL</td><td>External Assessment of Internal Audit Department</td><td>2026</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>05</td><td>SNGPL</td><td>Development of Enterprise Risk Management Framework</td><td>2018</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>06</td><td>GEPCO</td><td>Physical verification, accountal and tagging of fixed assets</td><td>2022</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>07</td><td>NTDC</td><td>Risk Assessment of NTDC</td><td>2014</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>08</td><td>Human Right Commission</td><td>Retrospective Internal Audit of Project's</td><td>2017</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>09</td><td>Marie Stopes Society Pakistan</td><td>Internal Audit</td><td>2023</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>10</td><td>DHA</td><td>Internal Audit</td><td>2023</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
</table>
3. M/s. Crowe possesses propose the following team of professionals, covering the scope of the assignment, as follows:</td><td>2nd ranked</td></tr>
</table>

Sr. NO.	Name of Consultant	Position	Requirement	Qualification / Experience of the Consultant
01	Saad Naveed	Team Lead	CA/CPA/ACCA with 10 years' work experience	ACA with 16 years of experience
02	Sidra Anwar	Coordinator-I	16 year education with 7 year relevant experience	FCCA with 10 years of experience
03	Mohsin Zia	Coordinator-II	16 year education with 7 year relevant experience	ACA with 05 years of experience
04	M. Zaeem	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-I	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	ACA with 5+ years of experience.
05	Ali Javed	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-II	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	CA Finalist with 7 years of experience
06	Zainab Iqbal	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-III	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	CA Finalist with 5 years of experience
07	M. Nouman Subhani	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-IV	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	CA Finalist with 5 years of experience.

Strengths & Weakness:

Strengths

- Member of international Crowe network
- Strong experience in risk management and internal audit frameworks
- Diverse portfolio (SNGPL, NTDC, GEPCO)
- Exposure to enterprise risk management

Weaknesses

- Team composition includes more mid-level/part-qualified staff

<table>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>
• Less direct experience in donor-funded program audits
• Team experience slightly lower compared to top firms
Remarks:
Technically capable, especially in risk frameworks, but comparatively weaker in team strength and donor audit experience.
Conclusion:
The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as 10 years' of relevant work experience, have completed at least Five (05) similar projects, and has sufficient HR / Managerial Capacity and Technical Expertise in the areas covered in the TORs, hence, shortlisted and ranked 2nd
</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03</td>
<td>M/s. Riaz Ahmad, Saqib, Gohar & Co. Chartered Accountants (RASG)</td>
<td>
1. The firm M/s. RASG & Co. was registered in 1995 and has over 30 years of professional experience. The firm fulfills the requirement of at least 10 years' relevant experience in auditing, monitoring, assessing and verification of financials in public sector/donor funded programs as relevant to the TORs
2. M/s. RASG & Co. has completed multiple assignments. The detail of similar projects considered are given as under:
<table>
<tr><th>Sr#</th><th>Name of Client</th><th>Assignment Name</th><th>Duration</th><th>Cost</th></tr>
<tr><td>1</td><td>LG & CD Department-PICIIP</td><td>Internal Audit</td><td>2024</td><td>PKR. 23.64 Million</td></tr>
<tr><td>2</td><td>PMIU-PESRP</td><td>Internal Audit</td><td>2022</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>3</td><td>PMDFC</td><td>Financial audit</td><td>2021-23</td><td>PKR. 31.0 Million</td></tr>
<tr><td>4.</td><td>PMDFC</td><td>Financial Audit</td><td>2019-21</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>5</td><td>International Islamic Relief Organization-Saudia Arabia</td><td>Financial audit</td><td>2012</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>6</td><td>Pakistan Stone Development Company</td><td>Internal Audit</td><td>2010</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>7</td><td>Pakistan Television</td><td>Internal Audit</td><td>2008</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
</table>
3. Riaz Ahmad Saqib Gohar & Co. propose the following team of professionals, covering the scope of the assignment, as follows:
<table>
<tr><th>Sr. NO.</th><th>Name of Consultant</th><th>Position</th><th>Requirement</th><th>Qualification / Experience of the Consultant</th></tr>
<tr><td>01</td><td>Gohar Manzoor</td><td>Team Lead</td><td>CA/CPA/ACCA</td><td>FCS with 40 years experience</td></tr>
</table>
</td>
<td>3rd Ranked</td>
</tr>
</table>

			with 10 years' work experience	
02	Aqeel Hyder Qurashi	Coordinator-I	16 year education with 7 year relevant experience	MBA with 08 year experience
03	Asif Hussain	Coordinator-II	16 year education with 7 year relevant experience	MBA with 10 years experience
04	M. Abrar	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-I	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	CA with 05 years of experience
05	Faizan Hanif	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-II	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	CA with 05 years experience
06	Faisal Habib	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-III	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	CA with 10 years experience
07	Mubashir Ali	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-IV	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	ACCA with 11 years of experience

Strengths & Weakness:

Strengths

- Strong public sector audit experience (PMIU, PMDFC, LG&CD)
- Good continuity of assignments over time
- Experienced leadership (40+ years at top level)
- Adequate team depth and qualifications

Weaknesses

- Limited evidence of international donor exposure at KPMG level
- Some assignments lack cost/value clarity
- Slightly less structured team compared to KPMG

Remarks:
Very strong local firm with solid government experience, but slightly behind KPMG in international exposure and sophistication.

Conclusion:

The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as 10 years' of relevant work experience, have completed at least Five (05) similar projects, and has sufficient HR / Managerial Capacity and Technical Expertise in the areas covered in the TORs, hence, shortlisted and ranked 3rd

04 — M/s. Muniff Ziauddin & Co.

1. The firm M/s. Muniff Ziauddin & Co. was registered in 1974 and has over 52 years of professional experience. The firm fulfills the requirement of at least 10 years' relevant experience in auditing, monitoring, assessing and verification of financials in public sector/donor funded programs as relevant to the TORs
2. M/s. Muniff Ziauddin. has completed multiple assignments. The detail of similar projects considered are given as under:

Sr#	Name of Client	Assignment Name	Duration	Cost
01	Sugarcane & Research Development	Internal Audit	2022-23	Not provided
02	Punjab Education Foundation	Internal Audit	2022-23	Not provided
03	Bahawalpur Waste Management Co.	Internal Audit	2022-23	Not provided
04	Punjab Central Business District Development Authority	Internal Audit	2024-25	2.345 M
05	Punjab Power Development Company	Internal Audit	2022-24	Not provided
06	Punjab Population Innovation Fund	Internal Audit	2023-24	Not provided
07	World Wide Fund for Nature	Internal Audit	2024-25	0.960 M
08	National Vocational & Technical Training Commission	Internal Audit	2024-25	Not provided

3. M/s. Muniff Ziauddin Pakistan propose the following team of professionals, covering the scope of the assignment, as follows:

Sr. NO.	Name of Consultant	Position	Requirement	Qualification / Experience of the Consultant
01	M. Moin Khan	Team Lead	CA/CPA/ACCA with 10 years' work experience	FCA with 30 year experience

4th ranked

02	M. Ali Latif	Coordinator-I	16 year education with 7 year relevant experience	FCA with 20+ year of experience
03	Sohail Saleem	Coordinator-II	16 year education with 7 year relevant experience	ACA with 10+ years of experience
04	M. Haris Mehmood	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-I	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	ACA with 9+ years of experience
05	Arqum Naveed	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-II	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	ACA with 5+ years of experience
06	Hammad Farid	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-III	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	ACA with 5+ years of experience
07	Aryaan Tariq	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-IV	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	ACA with 5+ years of experience

Strengths & Weakness:

Strengths

- Wide range of public sector clients
- Strong senior leadership experience
- Consistent internal audit assignments
- Good technical depth in team

Weaknesses

- Most projects are mid-scale, limited high-value flagship projects
- Less exposure to large donor-funded programs
- Limited evidence of complex risk-based audits

Remarks:

Reliable and technically sound firm, but lacks scale and complexity exposure compared to top two.

		Conclusion: The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as 10 years' of relevant work experience, have completed at least Five (05) similar projects, and has sufficient HR / Managerial Capacity and Technical Expertise in the areas covered in the TORs, hence, shortlisted and ranked 3rd.	
05	**M/s. UHY Hassan Naeem & Co.**	1. The firm M/s. UHY Hassan Naeem & Co. was registered in 2006 and has over 20 years of professional experience. The firm fulfills the requirement of at least 10 years' relevant experience in auditing, monitoring, assessing and verification of financials in public sector/donor funded programs as relevant to the TORs 2. M/s. UHY Hassan Naeem & Co. has completed multiple assignments. The detail of similar projects considered are given as under:	5th ranked

Sr#	Name of Client	Assignment Name	Duration	Cost
01	Punjab Transport Company	Internal Audit	2024	PKR. 125,000
02	GEPCO Ltd.	Internal Audit	2025	Not provided
03	The Punjab Employees Social Security Institution	Audit of Procurement process	2018	PKR. 185,000
04	Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department	Audit of Procurement	2017	PKR. 5,250,000
05	University of Agriculture Faisalabad	Audit of Endowment funds	2023	Not provided
06	GCU Lahore	External Auditor	2022	Not provided
07	Punjab Mineral Development Corporation	Statutory Audit	2019-21	Not provided
08	Institute of Public Health	Annual audit	2021-22	PKR.150,000
09	Punjab Human Organ Transplantation Authority	Third Party of Accounts	2023	PKR. 150,000
10.	Punjab Institute of Mental Health Lahore	Third Party Audit	2022-23	PKR. 450,000
11.	Nishtar Medical University Multan	Third party audit	2022-23	PKR. 750,000
12.	Govt. M. Nawaz Sharif Teaching Hospital Lahore	Third Party Audit	2022-23	PKR.300,000
13	Faisalabad Medical University, Faisalabad	Third Party Validation of Accounts	2023	PKR. 2,000,000
14	Children Hospital Faisalabad	TPV of accounts	2023	PKR. 750,000

15	Gujranwala Waste Management Company	Statutory Audit	2024	PKR 650,000
16	B.Pur Waste Management Company	External Audit	2024	PKR. 500,000
17	PPC Bank Ltd.	External Auditor	20225	Not provided

3. M/s. M/s. UHY Hassan Naeem & Co. propose the following team of professionals, covering the scope of the assignment, as follows:

Sr. NO.	Name of Consultant	Position	Requirement	Qualification / Experience of the Consultant
01	Mr. Ibne Hassan	Team Lead	CA/CPA/ACCA with 10 years' work experience	FCA with 36+ years of experience
02	Syed Aoun Muhammad	Coordinator-I	16 year education with 7 year relevant experience	MS Accounting & Finance with 17+ years of experience
03	Waqas Mirza	Coordinator-II	16 year education with 7 year relevant experience	MBA Finance with 15+ years of experience
04	Mran Iqbal	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-I	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	FCA with 29+ years of experience
05	Malik Arsalan Khan	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-II	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	FCA with 17+ years of experience
06	Malik Arsalan	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-III	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	ACA with 10+ years of experience
07	Ali Irfan	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-IV	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	ACA with 5+ years of experience

Strengths & Weakness:

Strengths

- Highly experienced senior professionals
- Large number of public sector audit assignments
- Strong presence in health and education sector audits

Weaknesses

- Majority assignments are small to medium scale
- Limited exposure to large, complex donor-funded programs
- Less structured team hierarchy
- Some assignments appear low-value, indicating limited scale

Remarks:

Meets eligibility but ranks lower due to scale, complexity, and strategic audit experience gaps.

Conclusion:

The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as 10 years' of relevant work experience, have completed at least Five (05) similar projects, and has sufficient HR / Managerial Capacity and Technical Expertise in the areas covered in the TORs, hence, shortlisted and ranked 5th.

06	**M/s. Malik Haroon Ahmad & Co.**	1. The firm M/s. MHA & Co. was registered in 2009 and has over 17 years of professional experience. The firm fulfills the requirement of at least 10 years' relevant experience in auditing, monitoring, assessing and verification of financials in public sector/donor funded programs as relevant to the TORs 2. M/s. MHA &CO. has completed multiple assignments. The detail of similar projects considered are given as under:	6th ranked

Sr#	Name of Client	Assignment Name	Duration	Cost
01	Punjab Energy Holding Company Pvt Ltd.	External Audit	2025	Not provided
02	LDA	Annual Audit	2024	Not provided
03	PEC Ltd.	Audit Engagement	2024	Not provided
04	Collage of Ophthalmology & Allied Vision Sciences	Annual Financial Audit	2025	Not provided
05	PHIMC	Internal audit	2025	Not provided
06	GEPCO Ltd.	Internal Aduit	2025	Not provided

3. M/s. M/s. Malik Haroon Ahmad & Co. propose the following team of professionals, covering the scope of the assignment, as follows:

Sr. NO.	Name of Consultant	Position	Requirement	Qualification / Experience of the Consultant
1	Syed Muzahir Hussain Kazmi	Team Lead	CA/CPA/ACCA with 10 years' work experience	ACA
2	Mirza Saadullah Baig	Coordinator-I	16 year education with 7 year relevant experience	CIA
3	M. Abdullah	Coordinator-II	16 year education with 7 year relevant experience	FCCA
4	Usman Tahir	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-I	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	FCCA
5	Talal Ashraf	FCA	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	FCA
6	M. Shahid	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-III	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	FCCA
7	M. Waqas	Associates/ Experts/ Accountants-IV	CA/CPA/ACCA with 5 years' work experience	CA

Strengths & Weakness:

Strengths

- Meets minimum eligibility (10+ years experience)
- Adequate number of assignments
- Qualified team (ACA, FCCA, CIA mix)

Weaknesses

- Lowest scale and complexity among all firms
- Limited exposure to major public sector/donor-funded programs
- Assignments mostly routine audits
- Comparatively less institutional capacity

		Remarks: **Suitable for** small to mid-level assignments**, but not for a** large World Bank-funded program like PCAP. **Conclusion:** The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as 10 years' of relevant work experience, have completed at least Five (05) similar projects, and has sufficient HR / Managerial Capacity and Technical Expertise in the areas covered in the TORs, hence, shortlisted and ranked 6th.	

Decisions:

After detailed deliberations, the CSC made the following decisions;

i) Approved the evaluation of EOIs and shortlisting report.

ii) RFP cleared for issuance to top ranked firm i.e; KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co. Pakistan under CQS method as defined in World Bank Procurement Regulations.

Procurement & Contract Management Specialist
CMU-PCAP

M&E Specialist
CMU-PCAP

Nominee from P&D Board
Member

Program Manager
CMU-PCAP

Program Director
CMU-PCAP