Coordination & Monitoring Unit
Punjab Clean Air Program (PCAP)
Planning & Development Board,

Government of the Puniab

SHORTLISTING REPORT

REQUEST FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (REOI)

Industrial Emission Baseline, Fuel Mix Assessment and Regulatory Compliance Review

---

Ref# PK- 539171-CS-CQS

May 13, 2026

Program Director, CMU-Punjab Clean Air Program, Planning & Development Board,
06-A, Ahmad Block, New Garden Town
Lahore

I. BACKGROUND

The Punjab Clean Air Program (PCAP) is a World Bank-funded hybrid of Program for Results (PforR) to link funding with measurable improvements and Investment Project Financing (IPF) operation to support technical assessments, policy development, and institutional capacity-building, with a total cost of USD 300 million over 5 years (2025-2030). The program integrates strategies such as expanding public transport with electric buses, enforcing stricter vehicle inspections, retiring high-emission vehicles, and promoting electric two- and three-wheelers. These interventions are designed to reduce traffic congestion, improve fuel efficiency, and lower carbon emissions, ultimately fostering a more sustainable urban transport system. The Program Development Objective is to strengthen air quality management and reduce population-weighted PM 2.5 annual average exposure in Lahore Division.

II. SHORTLISTING PROCESS

i. REQUEST FOR EXPRESSION OF INTERESTS (REOIs)

The Request for Expression of Interest (REOI) was published in national newspapers on March 26, 2026, vide IPL No. 2995, and also uploaded on the websites of CMU-PCAP and STEP.

The following 08 firms participated in the procurement process:

Sr.No	Name of Firms
1.	KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co. Pakistan JV M/s. Sustainable Environmental Solutions Pvt Ltd. and M/s. Water Environment Laboratories & Consultancy Services (WELCOS)
2.	M/s. Ricardo-AEA Ltd. in association with Green Growth Consultant (GGC)
3.	M/s. Pak Green Enviro – Engineering (Pvt) Ltd.
4.	M/s. TUMAS Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting Co. JV M/s. EMC Pakistan Pvt. Ltd and M/s. Otium Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd.
5.	M/s. Air Quality Consultants Limited UK, Consortium with Aether Pakistan Air Quality Initiative (PAQI) and Carbon Smart Growth (CSG)
6.	M/s. Project Procurement International – Technology JV with M/s. Management Integratix (TMI)
7.	M/s. PITCO Pvt Ltd.
8.	M/s. Aninver Development Partner, S.L. and Momentum

ii. SUBMISSION OF EOI

The date and time for submission of EOI was fixed on 10.04.2026 at 05:00 P.M. The EOIs from above mentioned Eight (08) firms were received on or before the fixed date and time. EOI received after closing date and time and submission of EOI through email did not considered for evaluation.

iii. SHORTLISTING CRITERIA

The Consultant Selection Committee (CSC) evaluated the Expression of Interests (EOIs) on the basis of following parameters as mentioned in the Request for Expression of Interest (REOIs):

- At least 10 Years' relevant experience in industrial emissions assessment, regulatory compliance, resource efficiency, and air quality management

as relevant to the TORs shall be required **(Letter of Incorporation of firms will be required).**

- Should have completed at least Five (05) similar projects in public sector / donor funded projects of comparable scale and complexity **(Copies of verifiable of similar nature of contracts with copies of notification of award and/or contracts and full address and contact information of the employer)**.
- Should have sufficient HR / managerial capacity and expertise in the areas covered in the TORs**. [CVs will not be evaluated at the shortlisting stage].**

iv. SHORTLISTED FIRMS

<table>
<tr><th>Sr. No.</th><th>Name of Firm</th><th>Reasons for Shortlisting</th><th>Status of the Firm</th></tr>
<tr><td>01</td><td>KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co. Pakistan JV M/s. Sustainable Environmental Solutions Pvt Ltd. and M/s. Water Environment Laboratories & Consultancy Services (WELCOS)</td><td>1. The firm M/s. KPMG Pakistan was registered in 1970 and has over 56 years of professional experience. The JV partners of the firm M/s. Sustainable Environmental Solution and Water Environment Laboratories & Consultancy Services. The firm fulfills the requirement of at least 10 Years' relevant experience in industrial emissions assessment, regulatory compliance, resource efficiency, and air quality management as relevant to the TORs.
2. M/s. KPMG Pakistan has completed multiple large-scale assignments. The detail of similar projects considered are given as under:
<table>
<tr><th>Sr#</th><th>Name of Client</th><th>Assignment Name</th><th>Duration</th><th>Cost</th></tr>
<tr><td>1</td><td>UNOPS</td><td>Indonesia Industrial decarbonization – Market Assessment & Pipeline Development</td><td>2024</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>2</td><td>World Bank Group</td><td>Philippines Steel Decarbonization Development of roadmap for green and low carbon steel</td><td>2025</td><td>Not provided</td></tr>
<tr><td>3</td><td>UNDP</td><td>Provision of Strengthening Mitigation Planning and Investment Pipelines under NDC 3.0</td><td>2025</td><td>PKR. 36.125 Million</td></tr>
<tr><td>4.</td><td>UNDP for State Aviation Agency of Ukraine</td><td>Assessment of CORSIA implications on aviation and carbon market development</td><td>2022</td><td>USD 88,866</td></tr>
<tr><td>5.</td><td>GIZ</td><td>First Climate, ESG Health, Safety and Security Experience.</td><td>2022</td><td>EUR. 15,000</td></tr>
</table></td><td>1st ranked</td></tr>
</table>

3. KPMG Pakistan possesses strong HR and managerial capacity with a team of professionals, covering the scope of the assignment, as follows:

Sr. NO.	Name of Consultant	Position	Requirement	Qualification / Experience of the Consultant
01	Dr. Fahim Khokhar	Team Leader / Senior Industrial Air Quality Specialist	A senior expert with a Master's or PhD in Environmental Engineering, Atmospheric Sciences, or a related discipline, with at least **15 years** of experience in industrial air quality management, emissions assessment, emission inventories and cleaner production initiatives. The Team Leader must have proven experience leading complex environmental/industrial assessments, Scientific Research, Algorithm development for emission factors, preferably for World Bank or comparable development-sector projects. Strong analytical, stakeholder engagement, and report synthesis competencies are essential.	15+ years of experience in relevant field
02	Dr. Yousaf Jamal	Industrial Process & Resource Efficiency Specialist	Master's in Industrial Engineering, Mechanical Engineering, Chemical Engineering, or a relevant discipline. An industrial engineer or mechanical engineer with substantial experience (10 years) in industrial process optimization, energy efficiency, RECP (Resource Efficiency & Cleaner Production), and cradle-to-cradle approaches. The specialist should possess hands-on experience in conducting industrial audits, identifying process	10+ year of relevant field

					inefficiencies, and proposing low-cost operational improvements that directly reduce emissions.			
		03	Dr. Faheem Khokhar	Emissions Inventory & Air Pollution Modelling Expert	Master's or PhD in Environmental Engineering, Atmospheric Science, Environmental Sciences, Environmental engineering or Environmental management. An environmental scientist or engineer with at least 10 years of experience in developing facility-level or sectoral emissions inventories, applying international emission factor methodologies (IPCC, EEA, GAINS), and performing uncertainty analyses. Experience with air pollution modelling tools, emissions datasets, and industrial baseline development is required.	10+ years of relevant experience		
		04	Dr. Adeel Waqas	Industrial Energy System Specialist	Bachelor's Degree in Mechanical Engineering, Chemical Engineering, Energy Engineering, or related field. A mechanical or chemical engineer with specialized expertise in combustion systems, boiler and furnace efficiency, industrial heat processes, and fuel-switching options. The expert should have 5 years of relevant experience in assessing combustion technologies, comparative fuel performance, and evaluating alternative/cleaner fuels under local industrial conditions	5+ Years of relevant experience		
		05	Hassan Ul Haq	Industrial Regulatory	Masters in in Environmental Policy, Environmental Law, Environmental	5+ Years of relevant		

				& Compliance Specialist	Sciences, Public Administration. A professional with academic qualifications in Environmental Policy, Environmental Law, Environmental Sciences, or a related field, with a minimum of 5 years of experience in industrial environmental compliance, regulatory reviews, and enforcement system assessments. Required competencies include in-depth knowledge of NEQS/PEQS, Boiler Inspectorate regulations, PGDP frameworks, and institutional/governance assessments	experience	
		06	Dr. Ali Tahir	GIS & Spatial Analysis Expert	Bachelor's or Master's in GIS, Geography, Remote Sensing or Environmental Sciences. A specialist with a background in GIS, geography, or remote sensing, and at least 5 years of relevant experience in spatial data processing, facility mapping, emissions hotspot analysis, and preparation of geo-referenced industrial datasets. Familiarity with GIS tools such as ArcGIS/QGIS is required	5+ Years of relevant experience	
		07	Shahzaib Ali	Industrial Data Systems / MRV & Database Specialist	Master's degree in environmental engineering, Environmental Sciences, Data Science, Information Systems, or a related field. A data and systems specialist with at least 5 years of professional experience in design, management, and analysis of environmental or industrial datasets,	5+ Years of relevant Experience	

					including emissions inventories, compliance databases, or monitoring systems, verification and reporting.		
		08	Adil Bhatti	Environmental Economist / Data Analyst	Master's in Economics, Environmental Economics, Public Policy, or related fields. An economist or policy analyst with at least 5 years of experience in cost–benefit analysis, economic modelling of environmental interventions, health impact assessment, and analysis of air pollution–related socioeconomic impacts. Expertise in quantifying benefits of mitigation scenarios is essential.	5+ Years of relevant experience	
		09	Team	Field Survey Engineers / Data Collection Specialists (Positions: 05)	Professionals with degrees in Environmental Engineering, Mechanical Engineering, Industrial Engineering, or related fields, and 3 years of experience in industrial surveys, facility profiling, and technical data collection. They should be capable of conducting structured field assessments and working with industries to obtain accurate operational and fuel-use information.	3+ Years of relevant experience	
		10	Team	Research & Documentation Associate (Positions: 03)	Bachelor's or Master's degree in Environmental Sciences, Engineering, Public Policy, or related discipline. A junior-level team member with 3 years of experience in environmental research, data organization, technical documentation, and supporting the	3+ Year of relevant experience	

				preparation of analytical reports. Competency in data management and literature review is essential.	

Strengths & Weakness:

Extensive Experience:

Over **56 years of professional experience**, significantly exceeding the minimum requirement and all competing firms.

- **Relevant Project Portfolio:**
  Successfully completed **at least five (05) similar large-scale public sector / donor-funded assignments**, including work with organizations such as the World Bank, UNDP, and GIZ.
- **Strong Technical & HR Capacity:**
- Fully staffed team covering **all TOR-required positions**
- Expertise spans emissions assessment, air quality modelling, GIS, regulatory compliance, MRV systems, and environmental economics
- **Demonstrated Capability in Core Areas:**
  Proven experience in:
  - Industrial emissions assessment
  - Decarbonization strategies
  - Policy and regulatory advisory
  - Air quality management systems

Conclusion:

The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as 10 years' of relevant work experience, have completed at least Five (05) similar projects, and has sufficient HR / Managerial Capacity and Technical Expertise in the areas covered in the TORs. After seeking clarification from the firm and verification of the information provided in the Expression of Interest (EOI), the CSC shortlisted the firm and ranked 1st

02	**M/s. Ricardo-AEA Ltd. in association with Green Growth Consultant (GGC)**	The firm did not fulfill the requirement of completed at least Five (05) similar projects in public sector / donor funded projects of comparable scale and complexity **(Copies of verifiable of similar nature of contracts with copies of notification of award and/or contracts and full address and contact information of the employer**	Not Shortlisted
03	**M/s. TUMAS Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting Co. JV**	The firm did not fulfill the requirement of completed at least Five (05) similar projects in public sector / donor funded projects of comparable scale and complexity **(Copies of verifiable of similar**	Not shortlisted

	M/s. EMC Pakistan Pvt. Ltd and M/s. Otium Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd.	**nature of contracts with copies of notification of award and/or contracts and full address and contact information of the employer**	
04	**M/s. Pak Green Enviro – Engineering (Pvt) Ltd.**	• The firm did not fulfill the requirement of completed at least Five (05) similar projects in public sector / donor funded projects of comparable scale and complexity **(Copies of verifiable of similar nature of contracts with copies of notification of award and/or contracts and full address and contact information of the employer)**.	Not shortlisted
05	**M/s. Air Quality Consultants Limited UK, Consortium with Aether Pakistan Air Quality Initiative (PAQI) and Carbon Smart Growth (CSG)**	• The proposed key personnel are not aligned with the team of experts required under the TORs. • Insufficient HR and technical capacity to adequately cover all TOR-required areas.	Not shortlisted
06	**M/s. Project Procurement International – Technology JV with M/s. Management Integratix (TMI)**	• The firm did not fulfill the requirement of completed at least Five (05) similar projects in public sector / donor funded projects of comparable scale and complexity **(Copies of verifiable of similar nature of contracts with copies of notification of award and/or contracts and full address and contact information of the employer)**. • The details of similar projects provided are primarily from the private sector, which are not considered for evaluation. • The firm has presented ongoing projects instead of completed assignments, which do not meet the REOI requirement.	Not shortlisted
07	**M/s. PITCO Pvt Ltd.**	▪ The firm did not fulfill the requirement of completed at least Five (05) similar projects in public sector / donor funded projects of comparable scale and complexity **(Copies of verifiable of similar nature of contracts with copies of notification of award and/or contracts and full address and contact information of the employer)**.	Not Shortlisted
08	**M/s. Aninver Development Partner, S.L. and Momentum**	▪ The firm did not full fill the requirement of at least 10 Years' relevant experience in industrial emissions assessment, regulatory compliance, resource efficiency, and air quality management as relevant to the TORs shall be required **(Letter of Incorporation of firms will be required).** ▪ The firm did not fulfill the requirement of completed at least Five (05) similar projects in public sector / donor funded projects of comparable scale and complexity **(Copies of verifiable of similar nature of contracts with copies of notification of award and/or contracts and full address and contact information of the employer)**. ▪ Insufficient HR and technical capacity to adequately cover all TOR-required areas.	Not shortlisted

Decisions:

After detailed deliberations, the CSC made the following decisions;

i) Approved the evaluation of EOIs and shortlisting report.

ii) RFP cleared for issuance to top ranked firm i.e; **KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co. Pakistan JV M/s. Sustainable Environmental Solutions Pvt Ltd. and M/s. Water Environment Laboratories & Consultancy Services (WELCOS)** under CQS method as defined in World Bank Procurement Regulations.

Procurement & Contract Management Specialist CMU-PCAP

M&E Specialist CMU-PCAP

Nominee from Industries, Commerce & Investment Department

Nominee from Environment Protection and Climate Change Department

Nominee from P&D Board Member

Program Manager CMU-PCAP

Environment Specialist CMU-PCAP

Program Director CMU-PCAP