Coordination & Monitoring unit
Punjab Clean Air Program (PCAP)
Planning & Development Board,

Government of the Puniab

SHORTLITING REPORT

REQUEST FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (REOI)

Hiring of Consultancy Firm for Third Party Verification (TPV) of all DLIs of PCAP

Ref# PK-PCAP CMU-515512-CS-CQS

November, 2025

Program Director, CMU-Punjab Clean Air Program, Planning & Development Board, 11-A, Upper Mall Scheme, Mian Meer Road, Lahore Ph. No. 042-99332566-69

Fax. 042-35750283

I. BACKGROUND

The Punjab Clean Air Program (PCAP) is a World Bank funded hybrid of Program for Results (PforR) to link funding with measurable improvements and Investment Project Financing (IPF) operation to support technical assessments, policy development, and institutional capacity-building, with a total cost of USD 300 million over 5 years (2025-2030). The program integrates strategies such as expanding public transport with electric buses, enforcing stricter vehicle inspections, retiring high-emission vehicles, and promoting electric two- and three-wheelers. These interventions are designed to reduce traffic congestion, improve fuel efficiency, and lower carbon emissions, ultimately fostering a more sustainable urban transport system. The Program Development Objective is to strengthen air quality management and reduce population weighted PM 2.5 annual average exposure in Lahore Division.

II. SHORTLISTING PROCESS

i. REQUEST FOR EXPRESSION OF INTERESTS (REOIs)

The Request for Expression of Interest (REOI) was published in national newspapers on November 07, 2025, vide IPL No. 5993 and also uploaded on the websites of CMU-PCAP and STEP.

The following 08 firms participated in the procurement process:

Sr.No	Name of Firms
1.	M/s.EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants
2.	M/s. A.F.Ferguson & Co. Chartered Accountants
3.	M/s. KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co. Chartered Accountants
4.	M/s. PV LAB Pakistan (Lead) JV with Power Consultants
5.	M/s. EMC Pakistan (Pvt) Limited
6.	M/s. Associates in Development Pvt Ltd.
7.	M/s. Himat Consulting Private Limited (HCPL) JV with Elan Partners (Pvt) Ltd.
8.	M/s. G3 Engineering Pvt Ltd. (Lead) JV with Center for Social Research & Development (CSRD)

ii. SUBMISSION OF EOI

The date and time for submission of EOI was fixed on 21.11.2025 at 11:00 A.M. The EOIs from above mentioned ten firms were received on or before the fixed date and time. EOI received after closing date and time and submission of EOI through email did not considered for evaluation.

iii. SHORTLISTING CRITERIA

The Consultant Selection Committee (CSC) evaluated the Expression of Interests (EOIs) on the basis of following parameters as mentioned in the Request for Expression of Interest (REOIs):

- At least 10 years' overall experience with five years in monitoring, assessing, validation/verification of indicators in public sector. Experience in verifying and tracking DLIs for disbursements based on results achievements as relevant to the TORs shall be required **(Letter of Incorporation of firms will be required).**

- Should have completed at least Five (05) similar projects in public sector / donor funded projects of comparable scale and complexity (Copies of verifiable of similar nature of contracts with copies of notification of award and/or contracts and full address and contact information of the employer).
- Should have sufficient HR / managerial capacity and expertise in the areas covered in the TORs. [CVs will not be evaluated at the shortlisting stage].

iv. SHORTLISTED FIRMS

<table>
<tr><th>Sr. No.</th><th>Name of Firm</th><th>Reasons for Shortlisting</th><th>Status of the Firm</th></tr>
<tr><td>01</td><td>M/s. EY Ford Rhodes</td><td>
1. The firm M/s. EYFR was registered in 2002 and has over 23 years of professional experience including extensive work in monitoring, assessment and validation / verification of indicators with in public sector.

2. EY Ford Rhodes has completed multiple large-scale assignments involving independent verifications, third party validation and annual performance assessment (APA), meeting stringent DLI based disbursement requirements. The detail of similar projects considered are given as under:
<table>
<tr><th>Sr#</th><th>Name of Client</th><th>Assignment Name</th><th>Duration</th><th>Cost</th></tr>
<tr><td>1</td><td>Punjab Skills Development Fund (PSDF)</td><td>Third Party Monitoring and Evaluation of Vocational Training Schemes</td><td>2012-2025</td><td>PKR. 514.25 Million</td></tr>
<tr><td>2</td><td>Punjab Resource Management Program (PRMP)</td><td>Third party Validation under Punjab Public Management Reform Program (PPMRP)</td><td>2014-2019</td><td>PKR. 50.5 Million</td></tr>
<tr><td>3</td><td>Finance Department, Government of the Punjab</td><td>Third Party Assessment/Validation of Punjab Resource Improvement and Digital Effectiveness (PRIDE) Program</td><td>2022-2025</td><td>PKR. 25.5 Million</td></tr>
<tr><td>4</td><td>Punjab Educational Endowment Fund</td><td>Assessment of Punjab Educational Endowment Fund (PEEF) Scholarship Program</td><td>2012-2013</td><td>PKR 02 Million</td></tr>
<tr><td>5</td><td>Punjab Small Industries Corporation</td><td>Monitoring and Third-party Validation of “Self-Employment Scheme for Unemployed Youth” initiated by Punjab Small Industries Corporation (PSIC)</td><td>2012-2014</td><td>PKR 15.7 Million</td></tr>
<tr><td></td><td>National Disaster Risk</td><td>Third Party Evaluation / Validation</td><td>2024</td><td>USD.79,100</td></tr>
</table>
</td><td>Ranked-1st</td></tr>
</table>

		6	Management Fund	of Pakistan Hydromet and Climate Services Project (PHCSP)		
		7	Local Government and Community Development Department	Annual performance assessment of 16 MCs including the assessment of sustainable urban drainage systems	2021	PKR. 14.00 Million
		8	World Bank Group	Assessment of the waste-to-biogas potential in Sindh Province	2025	USD. 100,000
		10	Sindh Public Sector Management Reform Project (SPSMRP), Economic Reforms Unit, Finance department, Government of Sindh	Third Party Validation of Project Results under Sindh Public Sector Management Reform Project (SPSMRP)	2017-19	USD. 196,800
		11	Higher Education Commission	Third-party verification of DLIs for the program titled Higher Education Development in Pakistan (HEDP)	2021	USD. 124,922
		12	Finance Division, Government of Pakistan	Independent verification of Disbursement-linked Indicators (DLIs) of the Program-for-Results (PforR) Public Financial Management and Accountability to Support Service for FD, Government of Pakistan (GoP)	2019-22	USD. 80,000
		13	Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Youth Development Programme	Third Party Validation of BBSYDP Training Programs	2019-22	USD. 85,000

		14	Federal Board of Revenue	Independent Verification Agent (IVA) for Verification of Disbursement Linked Indicators for the project named "Pakistan Raises Revenue"	2022-24	USD. 70,000
		15	Program Implementation Unit, Planning & Development Board	Third Party Validation of Program Development Objectives for Jobs & Competitiveness Program (J&C)	2018-20	PKR.03 Million
		16	Program Implementation Unit, Planning & Development Board	Third Party Validation of Disbursement Linked Indicators for Strengthening Markets for Agriculture and Rural Transformation (SMART)	2018-20	PKR. 07 Million
		17	Finance Department, Government of Punjab	Third Party Assessment/Validation of Punjab Resource Improvement and Digital Effectiveness (PRIDE) Program	2022-25	PKR 25.5 Million
		18	Punjab Small Industries Corporation	Monitoring and Third-party Validation of "Self- Employment Scheme for Unemployed Youth" initiated by Punjab Small Industries Corporation (PSIC)	2012-14	PKR 15.70 Million
		19	Housing Urban Development & Public Health Engineering Department (HUD&PHED)	Independent Verification of DLI of Punjab Affordable Housing Program	2025	PKR.31.00 Million
		20	World Bank Group	Comprehensive Assessment of Alternative Bricks for Sindh, Pakistan	2025	USD 75,000

21	International Finance Corporation	Evaluation of Circular Economy Investment Opportunities and Constraints Analysis for Pakistan and Iraq	2023	USD. 239,065

EY Ford Rhodes possesses strong HR and managerial capacity with a team of professionals, including economists, sustainability experts, environmental scientists, MBAs, and project management professionals certified by PMI. EYFR has multidisciplinary team blends expertise in monitoring and evaluation, governance reforms, climate resilience, ESG advisory, and technical domains such as air quality and circular economy. The HR team covering the scope of the assignment is is given as under:

Sr. NO.	Name of Consultant	Position	Qualification / Experience
1	Dr. Irshad Ahmed	Team Lead	PhD in Chemistry (Industrial and Environmental) from Quaid-i-Azam 35 years of international experience
2	Abbas Ali	Engagement Partner/ Quality Assurance Lead	Fellow member of the Institute of Chartered Accountants of Pakistan and a CIMA qualifier 22 years of professional experience.
3	Syed Ali Raza	Monitoring & Evaluation Expert	Bachelor (Hons) in Accounting and Finance and certificate in Public Policy Economics from Oxford University, UK. Fifteen (15) years of professional experience
4	Zehra Aneek	Sustainability / Circular Economy Expert	Over 20 years of professional experience,
5	Azeem Sani	Project Coordinator	16 years of professional experience
6	Mr. Ali Abdullah	Environmental / Air Quality Specialist	Environmental Engineering from Newcastle Ten years of professional experience
7	Azam Ali	Transport & EV	Doctoral Research in Transport Studies

		Specialist	13.5 years of professional experience,
8	Dr. Nasir Javed	Contract / Legal Regulatory Expert	MBA (Public–Private Partnerships over 30 years of leadership experience in urban development,
9	Ms. Ayesha Gulzar	Agricultural Economist	Over 20 years of international experience in agricultural development, food security, and value chain strengthening.
10	Asif Rauf	Field Supervisor	Master's degree in business economics
11	Zishan Ali	Field Supervisor	CA (Foundation) in Audit and Accounting from ICAP, with a bachelor's degree in economics
12	Ammarah Arshad	Field Supervisor	B.Sc. in Economics Over ten years of experience in field research, monitoring, and community-based assessments
13	Mr. Qamar Rafique	Field Supervisor	Nine years of hands-on experience in large-scale field surveys, social research, monitoring, and data collection across the health, WASH, disability, taxation, and public service delivery sectors
14	Ms. Saira Malik	Field Supervisor	Master degree in Political Sciences 14 years of diversified experience in social development, field monitoring, household surveys, education, WASH, health, and community mobilization across Punjab.

Strengths:

- The firm has approximately 23 years of most relevant experience in public sector / donor funded program
- The firm has completed 07 Nos of similar projects which are most relevant to the assignment.

<table>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>
The HR proposed are covered in the TORs.
Conclusion:
The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as 10 years' of relevant work experience, have completed at least Five (05) similar projects, and has sufficient HR / Managerial Capacity and Technical Expertise in the areas covered in the TORs, hence, shortlisted and ranked 1st.
</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02</td>
<td>Associates in Development Pvt Ltd.</td>
<td>
The firm M/s. Associates in Development Pvt Ltd was registered in 2006 and has over 19 years of professional experience in independent verification, third party validation, large scale survey, environmental assessment and M&E Assignment

AID has completed multiple assignments involving independent verifications, third party validation, and documentary evidences are given as under:
<table>
<tr><th>Sr#</th><th>Name of Client</th><th>Assignment Name</th><th>Duration</th><th>Cost</th></tr>
<tr><td>1</td><td>Finance Department, Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa & World Bank</td><td>Third Party Verification Agent (TPVA) for DLI Verification under Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Revenue Mobilization & Public Resource Management Program</td><td>2020-25</td><td>PKR 17.7 million</td></tr>
<tr><td>2</td><td>P&DD, Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa</td><td>Third Party Monitoring Agent (TPMA) of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Governance and Policy Program (GPPKP)</td><td>2017-2022</td><td>PKR 7.3 million</td></tr>
<tr><td>3</td><td>KFW, SRSP</td><td>Monitoring Consultant for Aid to Uprooted People of Pakistan project</td><td>2018-22</td><td>EUR 849,000</td></tr>
<tr><td>4</td><td>ECORYS UK</td><td>Monitoring, Verification and Evaluation service provider for the DFID South Asia WASH Results Program</td><td>2014-18</td><td>PKR 11.17 million</td></tr>
<tr><td>5</td><td>HEC</td><td>Third Party Validation (TPV) of Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs)/ Performance Based Conditions (PBCs) of World Bank-funded Higher Education Development in Pakistan (HEDP) Project</td><td>2023-24</td><td>PKR 13.5 million</td></tr>
<tr><td>6</td><td>KP-HCIP, Elementary and secondary education department, Govt. of KP</td><td>Third Party Monitoring & Validation – Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Human Capital Investment Project (Education)</td><td>2023-25</td><td>PKR 72.6 million</td></tr>
</table>
</td>
<td>Ranked-2nd</td>
</tr>
</table>

7	KFW/ Germany	Technical Assistance and Monitoring Consultant for Rehabilitation and Reintegration of Temporarily Displaced People of FATA, Pakistan	2017-21	EUR 1.3 million
8	USAID	Third Party Monitoring Services for FATA Reforms Support Activity (FRSA), FATA Economic Revitalization Program (FERP), and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Revenue Mobilization (KPRM)	2022-23	USD 82,294
9	Enhancement (PULSE), Govt. of Punjab	Monitoring and Evaluation of Project Activities and Outcome Baseline and timeline Survey/Change Tracker Survey under PULSE Project	2023-25	PKR 40,718,494

The key team composition provided by M/s. AID. The brief team composition:

Sr. No.	Name of Consultant	Position	Qualification & Experience
01	Shabir Ahmad	Team Leader	over 40 years of experience working across Pakistan's infrastructure, energy, hydropower, irrigation, watershed, and environmental compliance sectors
02	Mr. Ijaz Mehmood	Project Coordinator	20 years of progressively responsible experience working with national and international NGOs, USAID projects, UN agencies, and government departments across Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
03	Dr. M. Imran Shahzad	Environmental/Air Quality Specialist	15 years of specialized experience in air quality monitoring, atmospheric modeling, emissions analysis, and the verification of ambient air monitoring systems
04	Mr. Sajjad Khan	Transport & EV Specialist	19 years of diversified experience in transport planning, public transport systems, intelligent transport systems (ITS), urban mobility, and large-scale transit projects across Pakistan and the UK
05	Muhammad Oves Anwar	Contract / Legal & Regulatory Expert	15 years of professional experience in legislative drafting, regulatory reforms, public

					international law, administrative law, criminal justice frameworks, human rights compliance, and governance reforms across multiple sectors	
			06	Habib-Ur-Rehman	Agricultural Economist	16 years of extensive experience in development, humanitarian, and government programs, with a strong focus on Climate Change Adaptation, Food Security, Nutrition, Livelihoods, Agriculture Value Chains, and Agribusiness
			07	Sana Ullah	Field Supervisor / Surveyors	7 years of experience in field operations, data collection, supervision, and communication focused roles
			08	Saqib Hussain	Field Supervisor / Surveyors	over 11 years of experience in environmental monitoring, waste management operations, and compliance assessments
			09	Mirza Muhammad Idrees	Field Supervisor / Surveyors	15 years of continuous work in social sector programs, large-scale surveys, and monitoring assignments across Punjab
			10	Muhammad Arslan	Field Supervisor / Surveyors	13 years of diverse experience in education, health, gender, family planning, and social sector program implementation
			11	Imran Saleem	Field Supervisor / Surveyors	15+ years in education management, field operations, project coordination, health programs, and large-scale community initiatives
		Weakness: • Comparatively less completed similar projects as compared to EYFR **Conclusion:** The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as 10 years of relevant work experience, have completed at five (05) similar assignments, and has sufficient HR / Managerial Capacity and Technical Expertise in the areas covered in the TORs, hence, shortlisted and ranked 2nd.				
03	**M/s. A.F.Ferguson – M/s. WaterSprint Limited (Sub Consultant)**	1. The firm M/s. A.F.Ferguson & Co was registered in 1969 and has over 10 years of independent accountants in Pakistan and offering assurance, business and IT advisory and taxation service to a large number of public, development and private sector. Whereas, the sub consultant of firm M/s.				Ranked-3rd

WaterSprint Limited have experience in water resource management, climate resilience agriculture, and information technology.

2. A.f.Ferguson has completed multiple assignments involving independent verifications, third party validation and annual performance assessment (APA), meeting stringent DLI based disbursement requirements. The detail of similar projects considered are given as under:

Sr#	Name of Client	Assignment Name	Duration	Cost
1	Department for International Development (DFID), UK	Portfolio Risk Assurance Programme (PRAP) for DFID (2011 - 2016)	2011-16	Not provided
2	School Education Department, Government of Punjab	Punjab Education Sector Reform Program - Third Party Validation	2010-11	-
3	Punjab Resource Management Program (PRMP), Government of Punjab	Punjab Jobs & Competitiveness Program (J&C) - Third Party Validation of DLIs and PDOs (2017)	2017	-
4	Punjab Resource Management Program (PRMP), Government of Punjab	SMART Program - Third Party Validation (2017)	2017	-
5	Planning & Evaluation Cell Agriculture Department, Government of Punja	Empowerment of Kissan (Financial & Digital Inclusion) Third Party Validation (2019)	2019	-
6	Punjab Resource Management and Planning	Asian Development Bank financed PSO reforms including Agricultural Marketing Study (2006-07)	2006-08	-
7	Financial Data Validation and Reconciliation for Energy Department, Government of Punjab	Reconciliation Regarding Chief Minister Punjab 14 PKR Relief in Electricity Bills for Domestic Consumers (201-500 Units)- Energy Department, Government Of The Punjab	2025	-

The key team composition provided by M/s. A.F.Ferguson. The brief team composition

Sr. NO.	Name of Consultant	Position	Qualification / Experience
1.	Hammad Ali	Team Lead-1	Chartered Accountant , 20 years of diverse work experience as a consultant in Public Sector Consulting, Risk Assessment & Controls, Audit and Tax Reforms
2.	Irfan Umer Faruqi	Team Leader 2	Chartered Accountant 25 years of professional experience
3.	Omer Salman Omer	Team Leader 3	Master of Science in Sustainability Technology Over the past decade, he has led projects focused on environmental and social compliance,
4.	Asim Salman	Team Leader-4	Chartered Accountant Over 10 years of experience
5.	Muhammad Jahanzaib Shoaib	Field Supervisor	Master of Science in Environmental Sciences
6.	Naveed Alam	Project Coordinator	PhD in Civil Engineering 20 years of experience
7.	Arif Rahman	Air Quality Specialist	M.Phil Environmental Economics 15 years of experience
8.	Kamran Ashraf	Transport & EV Specialist	Master of Engineering (Transportation Engineering) 08 years of professional experience
9.	Waqar Ali Sheikh	Legal Expert	Bachelor of Laws 28 Years of professional experience
10.	Ehtasham ul Hassan	Agricultural Economist	MS (Hons.) Major: Agriculture, rural Developmen 15 years of experience
11.	M. Aleem Zubair	Field Supervisor	Chartered Accountant 12 years of diverse assurance and advisory experience
12.	Saad Ali Dar Saad	Field Supervisor 2	Chartered Accountant 10 years of diverse work experience in managerial positions
13.	Muhammad Iqbal Qureshi	Field Supervisor 3	Chartered Accountant 6 years of professional experience in audit

		14. Mohammad Salman — Field Supervisor 4 — Chartered Accountant, 4+ years of expertise 15. Abdul Rehman — Field Supervisor 5 — Chartered Accountant, 02 year of experience 16. Mehak Iftikhar — Field Supervisor 6 — M Phil Environmental Sciences, 05 years of experience **Weakness:** • The firm did not provide sub-consultancy / JV agreement. • The cost of the similar assignments was not provided with the project details. • Comparatively less completed similar projects in term of scale and complexity **Conclusion:** The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as 10 years of relevant work experience, have completed at five (05) similar assignments, and has sufficient HR / Managerial Capacity and Technical Expertise in the areas covered in the TORs, hence, shortlisted and ranked 2nd.	
04	**M/s. KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co. JV with M/s. Rehman Habib Consultants (Pvt) Ltd.**	The firm M/s. KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co. is a member of firm of KPMG International & a member of the cohesive business unit was registered in 1970 and has over 10 years of overall professional experience in the relevant field whereas, the JV firm Rehman Habib Consultant Pvt Ltd. is engineering firm registered with SECP on 2005. KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co. has completed multiple assignments involving independent verifications, third party validation, meeting stringent DLI based disbursement requirements.	Ranked-4th

Sr#	Name of Client	Assignment Name	Duration	Cost
1	Program Implementation Unit – Planning and Development Board Punjab –	Third Party Validation of Program Development Objectives (PDOS) and Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) for Jobs and Competitiveness Program (J&C) and Strengthening Markets for Agriculture and Rural Transformation (SMART) Programs	2021-24	Not provided
2	Punjab Small Industries Corporation	Monitoring & Third-Party Validation of Chief Minister Self Employment Scheme (CMSES) for the period from 01.10.2016 to 31.12.2019.	2018-20	Not provided

		3	Punjab Small Industries Corporation	Monitoring & Third-Party Validation of Chief Minister Self Employment Scheme (CMSES) for the period from 01.01.2020 to 31.12.2022.	2022-23	Not provided	
		4	Punjab Health Initiative Management Company	Third Party Validation by an independent expert / auditor/ evaluator of Prime Minister National Health Program (PMNHP) Federal Chapter.	2017-18	Not provided	
		5	Punjab Health Initiative Management Company	Third Party Validation of Sehat Sahulat Program in 13 districts Phase 1.	2021-22	Not provided	
		6	Women Development Department, Government of Punjab.	Third Party Validation of Utilization of amount disbursed by PDCF society for the establishment of Day care centers in Punjab.	2016	Not provided	
		7	Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department	Third Party Validation / Audit of Health Council Funds Transferred to all 750 BHU's and all RHC's of Punjab.	2017	Not provided	
		8	Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department	Third Party Evaluation of Drugs Procurement (Supply, Testing, Distribution and End User Satisfaction Level) Finalized During Financial Year 2016-2017.	2017	Not provided	
		09	National Rural Support Program (NRSP)	Third Party Validation /Assessment of Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund	2012-15	Not provided	
		10.	Sarhad Rural Support Program	Professional services agreement with SRSP for TPV of their project USAID small grants and Ambassador Fund Program	2012-14	Not provided	

The key team composition provided by M/s. KPGM. The brief team composition

Name	Engagement Role	Educational Qualification	Year of Experience
Usman Tariq	Engagement Partner	ACA, FCCA, BSC Oxford Brooks	15 Years
Fahim Ali Khan	Engagement Manager	FCCA	11 Years
Dr. Akhtar Iqbal	Team Leader / Project Director	Ph.D (Environmental Sciences), M.Sc Environment, B.Sc Environment	19 Years
Javaid Ahmed	Project Coordinator	M.Sc. (Environmental Management)	41 Years
Ahsan Javed	Environmental/Air Quality Specialist	BSc (Environmental Engineering)	11 Years
Ali Murtaza	Transport & EV Specialist	M.S (Transportation Engineering)	29 Years
Masroor Ahmad	Contract / Legal & Regulatory Expert	MS in Water & Environmental Management	35 Years
Syed Shaiq Hussain Abidi	Agricultural Economist	M.Sc. (Agri Economics)	33 Years
Wahhaj Anwar	Field Supervisor / Surveyors	ACCA	8 Years
Umais Ali	Field Supervisor / Surveyors	ACCA	4 Years
Uzair Khan	Field Supervisor / Surveyors	Bachelors Lums	4 Years
Umair Masood Khan	Field Supervisor / Surveyors	B.Sc. (Agricultural)	4 Years
Muhammad Akmal Fareed	Field Supervisor / Surveyors	M.Sc. (Water Resources)	6 Years
Muhammad Shahid	Field Supervisor / Surveyors	B.Sc. (Agricultural Engineering)	6 Years
Malik Muhammad Asif Shehzad	Field Supervisor / Surveyors	M.Sc. (Water Resources)	6 Years
Shahzeb	Field Supervisor /	M.Sc (Agri)	6 Years

		Surveyors	

Weakness:

- The cost of the similar assignments was not provided with the project details.
- Comparatively less completed projects in term of scale and complexity.

Conclusion:
The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as 10 years of relevant work experience, have completed at five (05) similar assignments, and has sufficient HR / Managerial Capacity and Technical Expertise in the areas covered in the TORs, hence, shortlisted and ranked 2nd.

05	**M/s. Himat Consulting Private Limited (HCPL) JV with Elan Partners (Pvt) Ltd.**	• The incorporation certificate of the lead firm found missing. Whereas the JV partner M/s. Elan was registered from SECP during 2005. • The provided similar project completed by M/s. HCPL does not relevant to the assignment • The similar project provided by the JV firm M/s. Elan Partners does not supported with the documentary evidences nor relevant to the assignment. • The firm did not fulfil the requirement of completed at least Five (05) similar projects in public sector / donor funded projects of comparable scale and complexity (Copies of verifiable of similar nature of contracts with copies of notification of award and/or contracts and full address and contact information of the employer). • The firm did not provide the HR / managerial capacity and expertise in the areas covered in the TORs	Not qualified
06	**M/s. PV Lab Pakistan JV with Power Construction Pvt Ltd. and M/s. REEH**	• The firm did not have experience of monitoring, assessing, validation/verification of indicators in public sector. • Experience in verifying and tracking DLIs for disbursements based on results achievements as relevant to the TORs is found missing. • The firm did not fulfil the requirement of completed at least Five (05) similar projects in public sector / donor funded projects of comparable scale and complexity	Not qualified
07	**G3 Engineering Consultants (Pvt) Ltd. JV with M/s. Center for Social Research & Development (CSRD)**	• The firm did not have experience of monitoring, assessing, validation/verification of indicators in public sector. • Experience in verifying and tracking DLIs for disbursements based on results achievements as relevant to the TORs is found missing. • The firm did not fulfil the requirement of completed at least Five (05) similar projects in public sector / donor funded projects of comparable scale and complexity	Not qualified
08	**EMC Pakistan Ltd. Pvt.**	• The firm did not have experience of monitoring, assessing, validation/verification of indicators in public sector. • Experience in verifying and tracking DLIs for disbursements based on results achievements as relevant to the TORs is found missing. • On going projects of the firms are not considered for evaluation	Not qualified

		• The firm did not fulfil the requirement of completed at least Five (05) similar projects in public sector / donor funded projects of comparable scale and complexity	

Decisions:

After detailed deliberations, the CSC made the following decisions;

i) Approved the evaluation of EOIs and shortlisting report.

ii) RFP cleared for issuance to top ranked firm under CQS method as defined in World Bank Procurement Regulations.

Procurement & Contract Management Specialist
CMU-PCAP

M&E Specialist
CMU-PCAP

Nominee from P&D Board
Member

Program Manager
CMU-PCAP

Program Director
CMU-PCAP